

Federal Court



Cour fédérale

<p>Ottawa, June 12, 2019 - A Judgment was issued today by the Honourable Russel W. Zinn of the Federal Court in file T-238-80:</p> <p>IN THE MATTER OF JIM SHOT BOTH SIDES et al v HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN</p> <p>Translation of Summary into Blackfoot</p> <p>With the release of a decision on May 24 in file T-146-19, the Court took another step in making Court decisions more accessible – a summary was prepared in the Cree and Dené languages. The Court is following that same approach with release of today's decision, which will be accompanied by a summary in Blackfoot. The Court thanks the language keeper who is assisting with preparation of this translation.</p>	<p>O'mahk Iitssikokhitsimio'p</p> <p>Pináápssokimi, Iisamsootamstato'si Naatsikopoto, Natoka-Omahksikiipippo piihkssikopotto sstoyiimi – Ám Okakihtsamaan iisááh' sináákssin annohka ksiistsiko' náámhaa' Ikimopiwaah' Russel W. Zinn oomhíí O'mahk Iitssikokhitsimio'p ahní issksskoi'p T-238-80:</p> <p>AMÓ ATSO'TOAWA kí NÍÍ NIINAWAAKÍÍ</p> <p>moyíí Ohtookisat'sin Atsinikíísinaakssin itapiisawaa'ohtoop' Íítsí'poyi'tssin</p> <p>Aahmoi' ipo'tíip moi' aka'kihtsimaan annohk Aapistsi'sskitsaato's Náátsippo-niisó níít's issksskoíp T-146-19, oomhi' Iita'i'poyo'p mahtsi' isstsay' sapikamatsstaa Okakihtsimaan'isti oomakk ká ikkinisii's - aahmoi' atsinikíísinaakssin iksistsii yáakohtoop aní oosto' waawayi Níítsísinaa oohtsi i'powahsin. Amo' Iita'i'poyo'p ist'taa'twíssapoo'ya ni'to ohtowa'at ipokkitsimma'pya annohk ksiistsiko' aka'kihtsimaan, ohpokóoyisskat'si moyí atsinikíísinaakssin aahníí' Íítsí'poyi'tssin. Aamo' Iitssikokhitsimio'p ikiniyi'taki naah' i'powahsin asamohtoom' sspommihtaa moyhi' sopowatsistotoohsin' amo ohtookisatsín).</p>
<p>Summary of Judgment</p> <p>Summary: The Blood Tribe claims that its current reserve in Southern Alberta is not as large as it was entitled to receive under the terms of Treaty 7. The current reserve is 547.5 square miles, making it the largest Indian Reserve in Canada. It is located from the confluence of the St. Mary and Belly River (Oldman River) in the north east and consists of the land between those rivers to a southern</p>	<p>moyíí Atsinikaakssin Aka'kihtsimaan</p> <p>Atsinikíísinaakssin: Áámootsí Káinaa awa'anist moyí istkóómóópaí ksááhko ahní Waamsskaap Awahsin mata' niistó omahkoi aníí iksisttowat'pii aníí aakoíítaapiop'sin aníí ootsíí sapistoto'tíím'pyaa Innáíhtsookakihtsimaanistis Issksskoi'p. Annohk kitáwahsinnooni nikohk Nisetokiíípíppo-níísó-ehkiísiíka anao'k.kiipó áá'si, annohk issto omahkóó Níítsíapíí Ksááhko noohk Kíítsááhkominoóom. Annohk itsstíí óómhi' otsíao'to'wahtaahp Apahtóksipisskan kí Móókoan sisahtaayi's Oomhkiiniitahtaa áámhmoi' waapatohs ghíí isspstsií</p>

boundary 14 miles north of the Canada-USA border, just north of Cardston, Alberta.	kíítsásákomínóóm ihtásikii'sti ahní' stí níítahtaa's ghí'óómhi' waamsskaap a'kihtákssin Niisóíkopotta áa'si waapatohs míh' Iistkhááksin, ipsstsik waapatohs míh' Aakáohkíímí, nóóm Awasin.
The Blood Tribe advanced claims to three alternative sized reserves. The first and largest is the Blood Tribe's Big Claim, which the tribe says is the reserve Chief Red Crow intended it to have. The Big Claim territory extends west of the current Blood reserve to the former Kootenai River (now the Waterton River) and south to the Canada-US border.	Áámootsí Káinaa akkioo ohsísskkomann'istii anistii niyookskka myá ístomannikkoh kitáwahsinnooni. Nii' matóómstí ki istoko'namhkoo niitsii Káinaa'sti Ömahk Ohsíkaan, niitsii sopokúítsitapiikoan awah'ní kitáwahsinnoon Kinníína M'kíá' stówa iksstaatóóm máátsi inaanatoo's. Ááhm Ömahk Ohsíkaan awasin ííhtsítssítak waami'tóót's anoí Kitáwahsinnooni ghí'óómhií ííkááh Kootenáá níítahtaa (unch'óí Paahtomahk Níítahtaa) ki waamskaap'sti óómhí Iistkhááksin.
Alternatively, the Blood Tribe says that Canada established its reserve by a survey done in 1882, which marked out 650 square miles of land with a southern boundary that was 9 miles north of the Canada-USA border. The southern boundary of that reserve was changed in an 1883 survey to the present reserve. The Blood Tribe says that the reduction in reserve size was not done in accordance with the requirements in <i>The Indian Act, 1880</i> , and is illegal.	Tsaahtao', niitsii Káinaa awaanist'ká nóóhm Awahsin áakohtooma moyí istkóómóópaí ksááhko ahní' istkóómstaa'n íítapi níí Náánisikipippo-Náánisippo-Náátsi Sstoyiimi, sa'kihtáksin nin Naakíipíppo-Níítsíppo áa'si ksááhko óómhi waamsskaap íístkhááksin anníí Píhkssó áa'si waapatohs míá' Iístkhááksin. Ááhm' waamsskaap íístkhááksin níí' awahsin isawaa'ohtoom'a ahní' Náánisiomahksikiipippo-Náánisippo-Nioókska Sstoyiimi istkóómóósta'n annohk ika' awahsin. Níítsíí Káinaa awaanist'ká nííhm yiipistotsim'a nóóh awahsin manííkkohk'p máátohtssapoo áhniiti atsinikfísinaakssin nííhm Sopokúítsitapii Akákihtsimaan, Náánisikipippo-Náánisippo Sstoyiimi, ki ích' sawómmitapí).
In the further alternative, the Blood Tribe says that Canada never fulfilled its obligation under Treaty 7 to provide it with a reserve equal to one square mile of land for every family of 5. This is its Treaty Land Entitlement (TLE) claim and it says that its population at the time of Treaty 7 entitled it to a reserve of some 728 square miles, based on the number of Blood Tribe members receiving Treaty annuities in 1881.	Nííhyááh issoohtsik tsaahtao', niitsii Káinaa awaanist'ka nóóhm Awahsin káta' aanistsíí iksisttowansíí áásinaosáátóós' Innaihtsookakihtsimann-Issksskoi'p óómkoh hko'wáása' awahsin i'tomanistanikkohksíí ni't-áa'si ksááhko ana niisítíí ótapi'sin. Am inaanatóóm Innaihtsookakihtsimann (TLE) ohsísskkomann'istii waahkoomohsi'n kí awaanist'ka aní máániístíítapi'spa aní Innaihtsookakihtsimann-Issksskoi'p iksisttaowan'nistaah'yá mí awahsin óómhá anistáánikkoh'pi Ihkitsik-Kiipíppo-Náátsippoi-Náánisoí áa'si, áánhm óótsitáníístítapi'spí Káínaikoakisi ohkoitapiiyi Innaihtsookakihtsimann iihtáóhpommao'p aní Náánisikipippo-Náánisippo-Nitokska Sstoyiimi.

<p>The Blood Tribe says that Canada breached this treaty promise, failed in its fiduciary duty to honestly and accurately implement the treaty promises relating to the reserve size, and acted illegally in removing more than 100 square miles from the reserve established by the 1882 survey.</p>	<p>Niitsii Káinaa awaaniist'ka nóóhm Awahsin ííkhít'kaminimá amó nnaihtsookakihtsimann óótatówaatsimma'n, íftsskohpiá áhníí naato'wap oyi'tskohto'tsimáán máhtsí okamo'ta'pssi ki omatap ohtssapoo's níí Innaihtsookakihtsimann óótatówaatsimman'oohwa' níítof óómhi manistanikkohk awahsin, ki maht'sí sáámiitskhasíí óótay sao'tsi's o'tsitsk Kíípíppo áa'si nóóhm awahsin íftáakohtoopa' ahní Náánisikiipippo-Náánisippo-Náátsi Sstoyiimi istkóómstaa'n).</p>
<p>Canada denies all claims, and says that if any claims are proven, they are time-barred by virtue of <i>The Limitation of Actions Act</i> which provides that such suits must be brought within six years of the discovery of the events giving rise to the legal claim or the date with reasonable diligence they could have been discovered.</p>	<p>Awahsin sayi'tsimaatóóhm'ái amo'ta ohsisskkomann'istii, ki awaaniya'si káámitski'ki ohsisskkomann'istii ómahk aanistsí'sah, áhníítíí íískana-yo'kííp'a' mía' <i>Misam A'psski Atsinikítisinaakssin</i> ki itsinohtoom'á áánitsíí ohto'tooyíísp'stááp'ya aksíí sínot' ohtsaapíphtóóm'á noi sstoyíímí ahníí í'tska'pííttííp oohmániístaapi'spi óóhtsi sspikinnííp'wá ahníí okákihtsi's iisskkomann'istáán tsaahao' ahní ksíístsíkó ohpo'kíí súkóóya'p isina'satoosá ááhkhoot ííchó í'tska'píítsim'áa).</p>
<p>This trial was restricted to the issue of whether the Blood Tribe proved that Canada has any liability to it with respect to the claims it asserts. If so, then there will be a subsequent trial dealing with the remedy for any such liability.</p>	<p>Amoí' isttsksá'-waawakino'taksin íístkóómahsíí' áánihm a'psskííp tsaahtao' níítsi Kainaa' kahmáóómaníisa nhóótsí Awahsin ito'tsináaníyah nhí' inií'ítsimahn óómhi' iniýitsimáá níítsí ohsisskkomann'istii oohpawáánspái. Khááma omaníísá, ki ahkí' tsstsííp aníhm mátstííkí isttsksá'-waawakino'taksin isina'satóósá nííhm saapistsihmaan ito'tsináaníyah nhí' inií'ítsimahn.</p>
<p>The Court found that the Blood Tribe had not proved the Big Claim on the balance of probabilities, and dismissed that part of its action. The Court found that the Blood Tribe reserve had been created by the 1882 survey and that Canada illegally removed land when it established the smaller reserve according to the 1883 survey. The Court also found that the population of the Blood Tribe at the time of Treaty 7 was 3,550, entitling the Blood Tribe to a reserve of 710 square miles. Accordingly, it was held that the current reserve established by Canada was not in</p>	<p>Oomhi' Iita'i'poyo'p iníímyáh níítsi Kainaa' mahtsí aanistsí'iska' moyí Ömahk Ohsiikaan aahníí níítomaanístasí kamítapskokí, ki íístsáapiksíí ahníí íítootstí'p' óótapehskipooowah. Oomhi' Iita'i'poyo'p iníímyáh nootsí Kainaii óótksááhkoomwa' kiáámaahtsiksi á'pistotootsííp onaít Náánisikiipippo-Náánisippo-Náátsi Sstoyiimi íístkoomahn ki ohm Awahsin íísiimíí ipáóó'toomo ksááhko ahnii ootahyaktoosa nííma' i'nakohtssíí awahsin ni'to onait Náánisiomahksikiipippo-Náánisippo-Nioókska Sstoyiimi istkóómóópaí. Oomhi' Iita'i'poyo'p nookhátt iníímyáh nootsi' oohm'maníístapispá' nítsi' Kainaii ahni óótistapííspí Innaihtsookakihtsimann-Issksskoi'p aní Nioókska-Omahksikiipippo-Niisito-Kiipippo-Niisitsippo,</p>

<p>accord with the TLE. As a result, the Court also found that Canada breached its fiduciary duty to the Blood Tribe when it established the reserve.</p>	<p>ííksistowat’áah níítsi Kainaa’ onaít awahsin aka’níkkohk Ikhitsiki-Kiipippo-Kiipá áa’si. Ní’to), íístsitsaapoya’ noohm kiitskakoominoom íiyachootoomooghi Awashin maht’ tsaahpoo’wa annim IKW. Ki ispookanistii, Oomhi’ Iita’í’poyo’p máát iníímyáh nootsi’ Awahsin ííkhit’kaminimá níím naato’wap oyi’tskohto’tsimáán níítsi Kainaii ootahyaktoosá noohm awahsin).</p>
<p>The Court found that all of these claims but one was time-barred under <i>The Limitation of Actions Act</i> because the Blood Tribe knew or ought reasonably to have discovered the material facts giving rise to the claims, well prior to the commencement of this suit in 1980.</p>	<p>Oomhi’ Iita’í’poyo’p iníímyáh áámoosti ohsísskkomann’istii ki tokskáí iiyookiimatoop istaaht’ootsi Oomhi’ Misam-Sskskomaan-mi-Okakihtsimaan ki níítsi Kainaa’ iistiniimá tsaahtao’ oomahk istkátaaksá oohtakooniisa niitsisti’s ahniist ohsísskkomann’istii, anníík ahmoí otomatapápiis ahníí ohto’tooyíísp’stáán níím Náánisikiipippo-Náánisippo Sstoyiimi.</p>
<p>However, the Court found that the claim for breach of treaty was not time-barred. The Court held that the limitation period on actions for breach of treaty did not commence until April 17, 1982, when section 35 of the <i>Constitution Act, 1982</i>, came into force. That section provides that “existing aboriginal and treaty rights of the aboriginal peoples of Canada are hereby recognized and affirmed.” The Court found that prior to section 35 coming into force, First Nations could not sue Canada for a breach of treaty and therefore no limitation period runs until the cause of action of breach of treaty is actionable. As this action was commenced in 1980, the limitation period was not exceeded and the claim for breach of treaty was not time-barred.</p>	<p>Tsaahtao’, oomhi’ Iita’í’poyo’p iníímyáh ahníí ohsísskkomann ííkhit’kaminimá amó nnaihtsookakihtsimann mahtsí sskskaaki’sí. Oomhi’ Iita’í’poyo’p yínnim’á ááhníí misam-sskskomaan-a’paisíí oohtá ííkhit’kaminimáspíí amó nnaihtsookakihtsimann maahstsí omatap’apíí uhníí Matsiyikkapisaiki’somm ihkitsikopotto, Náánisikiipippo-Náánisippo-Náátsi Sstoyiimi, áníhm waanao’k okakihtsimaan Niiyippo-Niisito nííhmá Misam-Okakihtsima-sinaakssin, Náánisikiipippo-Náánisippo-Náátsi Sstoyiimi, í’tanistí. Áníhm waanao’k okakihtsimaan ahnáási mítssi “itstsii niitsitapiikoan ki Innaihtsookakihtsimann-Isstiis oostówaawayí niitsitapiikoan’itsi ánnoom Awahsin unch’ ahsti ííno’ wahsíí’ a ki ahksaapitoowah’ya”. Oomhi’ Iita’í’poyo’p iníímyáh poosápskootchíí áníhm waanao’k okakihtsimaan Niiyippo-Niisito okakihtsimaan waistá-óómha-aanistsíí’s, Sopokítsitapíkoan’itsí matak’khoot’ oohtoypíí Awahsin oohtsikíttahkisa Innaihtsookakihtsimann ki matatskskoompatoopa’ oohtahnistapíísp moí ííkhit’kaminimáán amó Innaihtsookakihtsimann ááhtahpsskiikasí. Aamoi ahpskááksin itomatap’api Píhkssikopotto-Náánisippo, moy’ Misam-Sskskomaan-A’paisíí maatsí oohtsitskaasíí ki moy’ ohsísskkomann ííkhit’kaminimáspíí nííhm innaihtsookakihtsimann mahtsi’ sskskaaki’sí.</p>
<p>As a consequence, the Court dismissed all claims against Canada, except the claim</p>	<p>Annohk iiistaanistá’píí, oomhi’ Iita’í’poyo’p ipokkitsimm’á ohkana ohsísskkomann’istii níístí Awahsin, iinokitanistíí</p>

that Canada breached Treaty 7 in failing to provide the Blood Tribe with a reserve of 710 square miles, as promised.	awaanistoo'p Awahsin íkhit'kaminimáan Innaihtsookakihtsimann-Issksskoi'p íits'sskohpííá oohmá íístomoohp'á níitsi Kainaii áahnim' awahsin ist Ihkitsik-Omahksikíípippo-Kíípó áa'si, n'íksissttowatahtpá.
The trial will continue at a future date to hear evidence and submissions on the remedy for this breach of treaty.	Amoí isttsksá'-waawakino'taksin aka omanista'stí ahni' íssoohtsik ksíístsikó aah'ghi ohtsimaa'tóóp' iistákottsiisin ki iipstikhatoop's míítsí ohkottaítsip's moyhíí ííkhit'kaminimáspí innaihtsookakihtsimann.
<p>A copy of the decision can be obtained via the Web site of the Federal Court: https://decisions.fct-cf.gc.ca/fc-cf/decisions/en/item/407748/index.do</p> <p>An audio recording of this summary in Blackfoot will be available as soon as possible on the Court website at: https://www.fct-cf.gc.ca/en/pages/media/webcast</p>	<p>A'moyíí atsinikíísinaakssin aka'kihtsimaan ohkott ohko'tsimaa'síí ahníím Iítáísííyiso'p oomhíí O'mahk Iitssikohhitsimio'p:</p> <p>https://decisions.fct-cf.gc.ca/fc-cf/decisions/en/item/407748/index.do</p> <p>A'hm ohtako omopístaan amoyíí atsinikíísinaakssin aahnnaa' Íítsí'poyi'tssin ááhgíí ikaiksistoop' píítsiyoohk mááhkoomanistap'ís aaním oomhi' Iita'i'poyo'p Iítáísííyiso'p áhníím:</p> <p>https://www.fct-cf.gc.ca/en/pages/media/webcast</p>